







Paucity of Health Data in Africa: An Obstacle to Digital Health Implementation and Evidence-Based Practice

Sulaiman Muhammad Musa¹, Usman Abubakar Haruna^{1,2}, Emery Manirambona^{3*}, Gilbert Eshun⁴, Dalhatu Muhammad Ahmad¹, David Adelekan Dada⁵, Ahmed Adamu Gololo⁶, Shuaibu Saidu Musa⁷, Abdulafeez Katibi Abdulkadir² and Don Eliseo Lucero-Prisno III⁸

¹Faculty of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria, ²School of Medicine, Nazarbayev University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan, ³College of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Rwanda, Kigali, Rwanda, ⁴Seventh-Day Adventist Hospital, Agona-Asamang, Ghana, ⁵Faculty of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Kaduna State University, Kaduna, Nigeria, ⁶Faculty of Pharmaceutical Sciences, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand, ⁷Department of Nursing Science, Ahmadu Bello University, Zaria, Nigeria, ⁸Department of Global Health and Development, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, University of London, London, United Kingdom

Background: Among the numerous challenges that Africa faces in improving its healthcare systems, the paucity of health data stands out as paramount. This study aims to examine the challenges related to the paucity of health data in Africa and its impact on the implementation of digital health and evidence-based practice. The findings of the study reveal that health data availability in Africa is both limited and frequently of poor quality. Several factors contribute to this concerning situation, encompassing inadequate infrastructure, a shortage of resources, and cultural barriers. Furthermore, the available data, despite its limitations, is often underutilized due to a lack of capacity and expertise in data analysis and interpretation.

Policy Options and Recommendations: To improve healthcare delivery in Africa, we recommend implementing novel strategies for data collection. It's important to recognize that effective information technology service is crucial for enhancing healthcare delivery, and a holistic approach is necessary to achieve this.

Conclusion: This brief presents information to help policymakers develop long-term solutions to Africa's health data poverty. Taking action based on this evidence can assist in addressing the problem.

Keywords: health data, digital health, evidence-based practice, health policy, Africa

OPEN ACCESS

Edited by:

Neusa Jessen, Maputo Central Hospital, Mozambique

Reviewed by:

Lebo F. Gafane-Matemane, North-West University, South Africa Filipa Fontes, University of Porto, Portugal

*Correspondence:

Emery Manirambona manemery1@gmail.com

Received: 27 January 2023 Accepted: 17 August 2023 Published: 29 August 2023

Citation:

Musa SM, Haruna UA,
Manirambona E, Eshun G, Ahmad DM,
Dada DA, Gololo AA, Musa SS,
Abdulkadir AK and Lucero-Prisno III DE
(2023) Paucity of Health Data in Africa:
An Obstacle to Digital Health
Implementation and EvidenceBased Practice.
Public Health Rev 44:1605821.

doi: 10.3389/phrs.2023.1605821

BACKGROUND

Africa faces a myriad of challenges in improving its healthcare systems [1]. As the second-largest continent with a total land area of approximately 11,724,000 square miles (30,365,000 km²) and the second most populous continent with an estimated population of over 1.4 billion inhabitants, Africa's representation in global health data is dismal [2–4]. As clinical practice is geared toward evidence-based medicine, patient-centered care, and value-based approach, health data has become a critical tool for clinicians to make informed decisions [5].

Health data has been defined as personal data concerning health. This includes all data about the health status of a subject and reveals information relating to the subject's past, current, or future physical or mental health status. It also includes information provided by healthcare professionals as well as information generated by patients; from illnesses monitored through mobile applications and smart devices to screening tests and nutritional data [6, 7]. Although many indices indicate that data is becoming the backbone of evidence-based practice and digitized healthcare systems, a huge gap in health data representation is appealing within the continent with the largest share [8, 9]. A study viewed the lack of health data as "health data poverty" which they defined as "the inability for individuals, groups, or populations to benefit from a discovery or innovation due to insufficient data that are adequately representative" [9]. When appropriately harnessed, quality health data has the potential to achieve personalized treatments based on patients' peculiar conditions, more focused health research and development, and improved insights for strategic planning.

The impact of healthcare data availability in Africa cannot be underestimated. The complex influencing factors and their interactions that affect the health of patients could be understood when health data is readily available, which in turn helps healthcare practitioners obtain significant knowledge and unravel patterns about health conditions, including rare diseases and those peculiar to the continent [5]. For example, the UK Biobank, Public Health England's 1,000 genome project, the United States' "All of Us" project, and the European Network of Cancer Registries, among others, have made genetic, clinical, biological, and socio-demographic health data available to clinicians in other parts of the world, thereby providing them with a better understanding of risk association and genetic causes of diseases [10]. When medical research and clinical trials fail to highlight specific demographics, valid data contribute to offering solutions to such unresolved problems [9]. Thus, the use of data in the health sector is critical for making evidence-based decisions [11]. Significant efforts have been put in place to consolidate the healthcare system, leading to improved health management information systems [12]. Unfortunately, most African countries allocate funds to address public health issues without adequate data, making it impossible to plan, monitor, and evaluate interventions [13]. As a result, the lack of health data has undermined Africa's quest to improve healthcare delivery and services [14]. This article aims to discuss the impact of paucity and the importance of harnessing health data in Africa to build a resilient health system on the continent.

EVIDENCE

Health Data Availability and Its Impact on Healthcare Delivery

The lack of adequate and high-quality health data in Africa has impeded the understanding of health-related issues [15]. Several studies have shown that healthcare providers can make informed

decisions about the most effective and efficient practices for delivering care to patients by synthesizing available data [16]. In this way, individualized care can be properly designed, adapted, and implemented, and appropriate patient-specific management can be developed to meet the needs of the patient [17, 18]. The availability of health data with algorithms developed from artificial intelligence (AI) and machine learning (ML) can help predict and determine the appropriate diagnosis and prognosis of health conditions, the proper drug prescription, the treatment alternatives, and even strategies to reduce the duration of hospital stays and prevent re-hospitalization and recurrence of diseases [17, 19]. For example, the usage of available health data resulted in a 40 percent reduction in the length of hospital stay and a 50 percent improvement in the effectiveness of treatment elsewhere [20]. Health data in form of patient registries is fundamental to monitoring and evaluating the outcome of clinical treatment and the performance of health technology [21]. These benefits can lead to improved health outcomes and the health status of African patients and the general population.

Africa faces communicable and non-communicable diseases (NCDs), with communicable diseases accounting for the majority of deaths, while NCDs are projected to be the major cause of morbidity and mortality by 2030 [22]. It is pertinent to note that despite the huge burden of diseases, the lack of comprehensive and large-scale health data prevents researchers from understanding patterns in antimicrobial use and resistance to inform clinical decision-making and develop novel therapeutic agents that could reduce the impact of diseases on the continent [15].

Health data helps in the identification of relevant information, opens up new research opportunities and strategies, and creates innovative and cost-effective drugs or interventions for diseases [23]. Moreover, during clinical trials, the response and reaction of different categories of patients to drugs can be predicted with available data, thereby ensuring that approaches to detect the safety and efficacy of drugs are enhanced, and proper comparisons between intervention options are made [17, 23, 24].

The absence of detailed and up-to-date health data has caused obstacles in the management and assessment of healthcare policies, plans, and strategies in Africa [15]. In addition, this data is necessary for the formulation of policies, budgets, and strategies at various levels. Further, through the analysis of collected data, better evaluations, reviews, and modifications of health programs and policies can be made, thereby allowing for more effective monitoring and evaluation [25].

Barriers to Sourcing Health Data in Africa

The African Union (AU) estimates that government health spending in Africa accounts for only 1% of total health expenditures, despite accounting for 24% of the global disease burden [13]. Several factors contribute to this, but the lack of precise data makes it difficult for governments and corporate donors to channel their spending on healthcare services. Health data sourcing in Africa has been a challenge due to the lack of a central electronic database and fragmented manual data gathering [26]. As a consequence, this leads to disparities in

the collection and capture of inaccurate data, which could lead to the underrepresentation of key segments of an entire population. Since these data are used to develop and validate digital health technologies, data-driven interventions will become detrimental and biased for a particular set of populations [9].

Maintaining patient trust is key to building an efficient healthcare ecosystem. The patient should be assured that their data is safe from phishing, malware attacks, and vulnerability [27]. Until data security is adequately addressed, data collection remains a big problem, and health data poverty will persist. Africa's growing population presents an opportunity for big data analytics in many business sectors, with healthcare examining the use of big data to find solutions for difficult diseases. Big data analytics requires high-quality internet services for efficient functioning. However, erratic network services pose a threat in that regard, and health data collection becomes a challenge, leading to health data poverty [28].

Lack of Health Infrastructure and Technology

In Africa, healthcare centers are understaffed and underequipped with Information Technology (IT) gadgets, patients have limited access to healthcare services, and there are communication gaps between patients and healthcare workers [29, 30]. While the use of mobile phones is only a subset of IT, it is worth noting that due to their low cost, ability to be easily carried around, ease of operation, and the durability of their batteries, particularly in rural areas, where there is unstable power supply, they have enhanced their utilization and penetration in Africa. The developing world has a 79% smartphone penetration rate with 2.2 billion mobile phones as of 2010 [31, 32]. Similarly, 50% of individuals living in rural areas were estimated to have mobile phones in 2012 [33]. The availability and penetration of mobile phones have been explored to minimize health problems and improve healthcare delivery. For instance, a study in Malawi captured the improvements recorded in enhancing healthcare service delivery through real-time information sharing. The approach used Short Message Service (SMS) communication to double enrolment for tuberculosis and HIV treatment [29]. A mobile phone-based system study was conducted in Rwanda, where the pregnancy was monitored through communication to reduce the delay in health-seeking behavior by sending an SMS to healthcare workers alerting them to timely medical support [32]. These initiatives could be expanded to include NCDs and other chronic infections.

Smartphone applications have reduced unnecessary hospitalizations and emergencies, thereby reducing healthcare spending, by encouraging self-management of chronic illness [9]. They have also minimized drug stock-outs by assisting in the procurement, ordering, and monitoring of drugs [33]. Despite the widespread adoption and use of IT in healthcare, these interventions are still relatively small. Lack of access to sophisticated mobile phones, under-skilled healthcare workers, unstable electricity, and the inability to implement large-scale healthcare reforms are some of the problems it faces [34]. There is

no doubt that the implementation of IT for aggregating health data in Africa will improve healthcare delivery.

POLICY OPTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Health data is cardinal in enhancing healthcare service delivery everywhere in the world, and the lack of it or its uneven distribution poses a threat to this course. The need for the enhancement of healthcare delivery in Africa calls for novel strategies to enhance data collection. It is imperative to note that enhancing healthcare delivery requires a holistic approach, and the importance of implementing an effective information technology service cannot be overestimated. Thus, we propose the following solutions.

Health Data Automation

Automation of health data can address the problem of fragmented manual data collection and enhance processes. Healthcare providers and pharmaceutical companies can unlock new insights to help them make better, and more precise judgments. Therefore, this empowers them to respond quickly to life-saving measures. To meet the ever-changing needs of the sector, several activities, including gathering complete patient data, recommending a patient's unique course of therapy, and giving stakeholders access to clinical data for their evidence synthesis, can be automated [35]. A study conducted in South Africa revealed that several benefits can be derived from the automation of health data in the delivery of healthcare. These include improved information security and patient confidentiality, as well as a reduction in healthcare costs [30].

Public-Private Partnerships

Healthcare delivery in developing countries is increasingly being delivered through public-private partnerships. Partnerships in some African countries have yielded results and improved data collection. For instance, Program for Appropriate Technology in Health (PATH), a non-profit global health organization, and the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation partnered with Tanzania, Ethiopia, and Malawi to create a Data Use Partnership [13]. These partnerships provided government agencies and global nonprofits with vital data needed to address public health challenges in the region by providing funding for national health information systems [13]. The Gates Foundation's commitment of about \$300 million to facilitate the success of various public health programs in Tanzania would have limited impact without the data obtained through Data Use Partnerships [13]. Thus, private-public partnerships can be leveraged to expand health information gathering and usage across the African continent.

Invest in Infrastructure and Technology

Infrastructure and technology are critical for the collection and utilization of health data in Africa. Adequate infrastructure and technology can improve the quality and accuracy of data, which

in turn can inform better decision-making in the health sector. However, there are significant barriers to achieving this in many parts of Africa. A report on the mobile economy in sub-Saharan Africa found that 44% of the adult population is not connected to mobile internet service [36]. This lack of connectivity is a major barrier to the collection and analysis of health data.

This can be done by identifying key infrastructure and providing an alternative to it. For example, the lack of sufficient electric power supply can be tackled by providing solar energy to power the internet service engine.

Promote Capacity Building and Open Data Initiatives

To improve the collection and analysis of health data for better patient care, the skills, and capacity of healthcare professionals and data analysts need to be enhanced through training, workshops, and educational resources on topics such as data management, analysis and visualization, governance, machine learning, natural language processing, and predictive modeling. Implementing standards and guidelines for data collection and storage can ensure data quality and reliability.

Open data initiatives make health data such as patient records, clinical trial results, and population health statistics available without any restrictions to researchers, healthcare providers, policymakers, and the public, in a format that can be easily accessed and used. This can be achieved through the use of open data portals and APIs. In Africa, open data initiatives can bridge the gap in data availability and accessibility, leading to better health outcomes for all [3].

Foster a Culture of Data-Driven Decision Making

Promoting a culture of data-driven decision-making in healthcare is important to ensure that health data is used to inform policy

REFERENCES

- Oleribe OO, Momoh J, Uzochukwu BS, Mbofana F, Adebiyi A, Barbera T, et al. Identifying Key Challenges Facing Healthcare Systems in Africa and Potential Solutions. *Int J Gen Med* (2019) 12:395–403. doi:10.2147/IJGM.S223882
- Davidson SHW, Busumafi K, Walter R, David N, Ladipo A, Innes J, et al. "Africa". Encyclopedia Britannica (2023). Available from: https://www.britannica.com/place/Africa (Accessed August 19, 2023).
- Department of Economic and Social Affairs Population Division. World Population Prospects-Population Division - United Nations (2022). Available from: https://population.un.org/wpp/ (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- World Health Organization. Global Health Observatory (2023). Available from: https://www.who.int/data/gho (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Jee K, Kim GH. Potentiality of Big Data in the Medical Sector: Focus on How to Reshape the Healthcare System. Healthc Inform Res (2013) 19(2):79–85. doi:10.4258/hir.2013.19.2.79
- GDPR.EU. Recital 35 Health Data (2018). Available from: https://gdpr.eu/recital-35-health-data/ (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Data Saves Lives. What is Health Data? (2023). Available from: https://datasaveslives.eu/what-is-health-data (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- 8. Sirugo G, Williams SM, Tishkoff SA. The Missing Diversity in Human Genetic Studies. *Cell* (2019) 177(1):26–31. doi:10.1016/j.cell.2019.02.048

and practice. This is achievable using data-driven tools and techniques, developing data literacy, and implementing data governance and management frameworks. Moreover, it can lead to improved patient care and more effective and efficient healthcare systems.

CONCLUSION

The study highlights the issue of limited availability and poor quality of health data in Africa and its impact on implementing digital health and evidence-based practice. The paucity of data is due to factors such as inadequate infrastructure, limited resources, and cultural barriers. The lack of capacity and expertise in data analysis and interpretation also hinders the effective utilization of the available data. Addressing this issue requires collective efforts from governments, non-governmental organizations, and the private sector to improve data collection and utilization to ensure digital health solutions are tailored toward the needs of the African region and can have a maximum impact on improving health outcomes.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

SM and UH: conceptualisation, project administration and design. SM, UH, EM, GE, DA, DD, AG, SM, AA, and DL-P: data collection and literature review; preparation of the original draft and visualization. SM, UH, EM, and DL-P: supervision, writing, reviewing, editing, and proofreading. All authors have read and confirmed that they meet ICMJE criteria for authorship.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The authors declare that they do not have any conflicts of interest.

- Ibrahim H, Liu X, Zariffa N, Morris AD, Denniston AK. Health Data Poverty: An Assailable Barrier to Equitable Digital Health Care. *Lancet Digit Health* (2021) 3(4):e260–e265. doi:10.1016/S2589-7500(20)30317-4
- Agrawal R, Prabakaran S. Big Data in Digital Healthcare: Lessons Learnt and Recommendations for General Practice. Heredity (2020) 124(4):525–34. doi:10.1038/s41437-020-0303-2
- Manirambona E. Health Policy and Systems Research in Sub-Saharan Africa During the COVID-19 Pandemic. Ann Trop Med Public Health (2022) 1(609): 1–2. doi:10.55085/aph.2022.609
- Nutley T, Reynolds HW. Improving the use of Health Data for Health System Strengthening. Glob Health Action (2013) 6(1):20001. doi:10.3402/gha.v6i0. 20001
- 13. Africa Health. Solving Africa's Healthcare Data Problem (2023). Available from: https://www.africahealthexhibition.com/en/media/news/solving-africahealthcare-data-problem.html (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Azevedo MJ. The State of Health System(s) in Africa: Challenges and Opportunities. In: Azevedo MJ, editor. Historical Perspectives on the State of Health and Health Systems in Africa, Volume II: The Modern Era. Cham: Springer International Publishing (2017). p. 1–73. doi:10.1007/978-3-319-32564-4
- Adebisi YA, Lucero-Prisno DEI. Fixing Data Gaps for Population Health in Africa: An Urgent Need. Int J Public Health (2022) 67:1605418. doi:10.3389/ ijph.2022.1605418

 TestingXperts. Significant Benefits With Big Data Analytics in Healthcare (2020). Available from: https://www.testingxperts.com/blog/Big-Data-Analytics-Healthcare (Accessed August 15, 2023).

- Viju Raghupathi WR. An Overview of Health Analytics. J Health Med Inform (2013) 4(3):1–11. doi:10.4172/2157-7420.1000132
- Tsai CW, Lai CF, Chao HC, Vasilakos AV. Big Data Analytics: A Survey. J Big Data (2015) 2(1):21. doi:10.1186/s40537-015-0030-3
- Wamba SF, Gunasekaran A, Akter S, Renfan SJ, Dubey R, Childe SJ. Big Data Analytics and Firm Performance: Effects of Dynamic Capabilities. J Bus Res (2017) 70:356–65. doi:10.1016/j.jbusres.2016.08.009
- BinarApps. Importance of Data Collection in Healthcare (2021). Available from: https://binarapps.com/importance-of-data-collection-in-healthcare/ (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Auffray C, Balling R, Barroso I, Bencze L, Benson M, Bergeron J, et al. Making Sense of Big Data in Health Research: Towards an EU Action Plan. Genome Med (2016) 8(1):71. doi:10.1186/s13073-016-0323-y
- Marquez PV, Farrington JL. The Challenge of Non-Communicable Diseases and Road Traffic Injuries in Sub-Saharan Africa: An Overview (2013). Available from: http://hdl.handle.net/10986/16451 (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Ganti L. Five Reasons to Embrace Data-Driven Drug Development (2019).
 Innoplexus. Available from: https://www.innoplexus.com/blog/five-reasons-to-embrace-data-driven-drug-development/ (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Krumholz HM. Big Data and New Knowledge in Medicine: The Thinking, Training, and Tools Needed for a Learning Health System. Health Aff (Millwood) (2014) 33(7):1163–70. doi:10.1377/hlthaff.2014.0053
- Kadengye DT. Why Fixing Africa's Data Gaps Will Lead to Better Health Policies (2019). The Conversation. Available from: http://theconversation. com/why-fixing-africas-data-gaps-will-lead-to-better-health-policies-111869 (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Tilahun B, Teklu A, Mancuso A, Endehabtu BF, Gashu KD, Mekonnen ZA.
 Using Health Data for Decision-Making at Each Level of the Health System to
 Achieve Universal Health Coverage in Ethiopia: The Case of an Immunization
 Programme in a Low-Resource Setting. Health Res Pol Syst (2021) 19(2):48.
 doi:10.1186/s12961-021-00694-1
- Abdullahi Yari I, Dehling T, Kluge F, Geck J, Sunyaev A, Eskofier B. Security Engineering of Patient-Centered Health Care Information Systems in Peer-To-Peer Environments: Systematic Review. *J Med Internet Res* (2021) 23(11): e24460. doi:10.2196/24460
- Kirigia JM, Barry SP. Health Challenges in Africa and the Way Forward. Int Arch Med (2008) 1(1):27. doi:10.1186/1755-7682-1-27

- Mahmud N, Rodriguez J, Nesbit J. A Text Message-Based Intervention to Bridge the Healthcare Communication Gap in the Rural Developing World. Technol Health Care Off J Eur Soc Eng Med (2010) 18(2):137–44. doi:10.3233/ THC-2010-0576
- Cline GB, Luiz JM. Information Technology Systems in Public Sector Health Facilities in Developing Countries: The Case of South Africa. BMC Med Inform Decis Mak (2013) 13(1):13. doi:10.1186/1472-6947-13-13
- 31. Vatsalan D, Arunatileka S, Chapman K, Senaviratne G, Sudahar S, Wijetileka D. Mobile Technologies for Enhancing eHealth Solutions in Developing Countries. In: Proceedings of the 2010 Second International Conference on eHealth, Telemedicine, and Social Medicine; 10-16 February 2010; Saint Maarten, Netherlands Antilles (2010). doi:10.1109/eTELEMED.2010.18
- 32. Ngabo F, Nguimfack J, Nwaigwe F, Mugeni C, Muhoza D, Wilson DR, et al. Designing and Implementing an Innovative SMS-Based Alert System (RapidSMS-MCH) to Monitor Pregnancy and Reduce Maternal and Child Deaths in Rwanda. *Pan Afr Med J* (2012) 13:31.
- 33. Nilseng J, Gustafsson LL, Nungu A, Bastholm-Rahmner P, Mazali D, Pehrson B, et al. A Cross-Sectional Pilot Study Assessing Needs and Attitudes to Implementation of Information and Communication Technology for Rational Use of Medicines Among Healthcare Staff in Rural Tanzania. BMC Med Inform Decis Mak (2014) 14:78. doi:10.1186/1472-6947-14-78
- WHO Global Observatory for eHealth. mHealth: New Horizons for Health Through Mobile Technologies: Second Global Survey on eHealth. World Health Organization (2011). Available from: https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/ 44607 (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- IT Brief Australia. Why Smarter Healthcare Depends on Data and Automation (2023). Available from: https://itbrief.com.au/story/why-smarter-healthcare-depends-on-data-and-automation (Accessed August 15, 2023).
- Healthcare in Africa. IFC Report Sees Demand for Investment (2023). Home.
 Available from: https://www.ifc.org/en/home (Accessed August 15, 2023).

Copyright © 2023 Musa, Haruna, Manirambona, Eshun, Ahmad, Dada, Gololo, Musa, Abdulkadir and Lucero-Prisno III. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.

PHR is edited by the Swiss School of Public Health (SSPH+) in a partnership with the Association of Schools of Public Health of the European Region (ASPHER)+